Urban Renewal: Scottish Approaches in a Wider and Longer Context

Duncan Maclennan
University of St Andrews
1. Image of city, renewal changes after 1990
2. Research gains; statistical not causal nor core evaluation questions
3. Contrasting Policies over countries
1. Understanding **ROLE** Cities and Neighbourhoods

In UK, Scotland

- Beyond Decay, Decline, Disadvantage
- Not Quite a New Synthesis on CCC
- But Recognition that cities
  - Connected spaces, Networks
  - Sectoral interactions, Endogeneities
  - Place matters, and accessibility/space
  - Spatial structures

LOCAL SYSTEMS GROUND, TRANSFORM THE
GLOBAL

RECOGNISED IN SCOTLAND, AUSTRALIA, NOT NZ,
NOT CANADA
1....Neighbourhoods as Well as metro

If Metro the major physical, environmental economy ‘functional space’, neighbourhood is where social systems cohere (in part, too polar)

• Policy moves from ‘area’ to ‘place community’ to holistic ‘neighbourhood’
• Rhetoric, research bit loose on overlap
• Substantial progress in last decade
2. Identifying Neighbourhood

- JRF programme (ARP) and ESRC Centre
  - Large in Scotland, now little either
- Ideas Centres
- Government statistics
  - GIS integration
  - Admin data
  - Longitudinal, still weak spatial functional interaction
- Defined areas, deprived or not
2.....BUT Weak ON

- Choices (and changing, critical)
- Interactions and Spillovers
- Changes
  - Baselines
  - Changing places
  - Changing dynamics (eg FTB’s)
  - Thresholds, triggers

**IN CONSEQUENCE....**
2...FOR NEIGHBOURHOODS

- What is the theory (ies) of change
- How replicable are trajectories, policies
- How do you stand up the policy rhetoric in each setting
  - Community-led better
  - Builds social capital
  - Positive neighbourhood spillovers
  - Creative rather than palliative

RENEWAL WORKS?
3. CONTRASTING POLICIES

• Strong intellectual framework, Acad...All
• Major professional interests....All
• Actual Programmes and scale
  – Not all, and must have one resourced to do so
  – Federal governments weak on this
  – Australian States better then Canada
  – NZ just getting with these ideas

All poor at renewal in decline versus renewal in a growth context.... E.g.Victoria...Melbourne
3. Australian Experience…

• Core change, growth
• Poor displaced to rental edge
• Absence of social, other infrastructure
• Ethnic diversity and visible minorities

READ AND EMULATE ENGLISH POLICY!
• Agencies to capture growth benefits (State)
• 20 social housing renewal areas
• Weak Dandenong partnership

THE POOR EDGE IS THE AUSTRALIAN CHALLENGE…..AND CANADA TOO?
3…and In Canada, WEAKER

- Feds in 1978-1984, Martin in, Harper out
- Few Provinces, ICSPs slipping
- Governance coalitions: Toronto v Vancouver
- Citywide problems: Toronto
  - Service reorganisations
  - Non-profits, innovation
- Professional understanding, inversions
- Some exceptional projects…TCHC
- Some exceptional partnerships

BUT CURRENTLY LITTLE PROSPECT WIDE RENEWAL OR CITY POLICY
III. CHANGING PLACES: UK

KEY LESSONS FROM PALLIATIVE PERIOD PRE-2000 (SCOTLAND LEADS?)

• Put community at heart of change
• Strengthen Regional Offices of Government
• Partnerships across levels of government
• Partnerships across community, private, gov
• Single sector approaches won’t work
• Community capacities: recognise, foster, improve
• Core role for Government Agencies
• Contingent, Competitive funding

BUT HOW, HOW MUCH, WHY, WHERE?
III  After 2000 Policy Content, and Structure (England leads?)

• Have outcomes at forefront of policy
• Recognise place outcomes and effects
• Coord across sectoral policies, means
• Coord across levels of government
• Subsidiarity, roles for Communities
• Place information, social capital
• But Effectiveness for higher order?

Place Matters for Policies in Processes, Effects and Outcomes
4. NEXT STEPS NOW: INSTITUTIONS

Government and governance

– UK, Scotland, LA, community

– Does policy really flow between levels, Reducing? Fracturing?
  – No convergence to English cities, renewal and rest?.
  – Bureaucrats?

• The Compact? Inadequate single outcome agreements?
  – What ensures resource efficiency, improved performance in poor performers

• Engaging or Strangling Communities
  – Should the community plan be audited regularly, externally?
  – Do communities miss a critical friend

– Does Scotland need more flexible regulation NFPs?
4. NEXT STEPS NOW: Core Challenges

- Resource constraints: de-emphasise renewal
- Gain capture, land and planning
  - 40 years of failure
  - Rebuild regeneration agency around this?
- Faster Planning Process in renewal
- Relaunch faster community ownership
- Service delivery, reconfiguration
- Rebuilding community dynamism?
- Renewal Education, Summer Lighthouse?
SCOTLAND’S RENEWAL SECTOR

• CONTINUE TO BUILD UNDERSTANDING OF RENEWAL CONTRIBUTION TO INCLUSION AND INCREASED COMPETITIVENESS
• LINK TO EMERGING COMMUNITY, CARBON AND CARE CONCERNS
• EMPHASISE THE LOCAL STEPS TO THE BIG GOALS
• POINT UP, IN TIME, HOW GOVERNMENT CAN RE-ENGAGE WITH COMMUNITIES AS WELL AS MUNICIPALITIES
• BUILTS A DECENT EVIDENCE BASE; RESEARCH IDEAS HAVE RUN BEYOND THE FUNDERS CAPACITIES IN NEIGHBOURHOOD RESEARCH